

JUDICIAL COUNCIL OF THE SIXTH CIRCUIT
MICHIGAN-OHIO-KENTUCKY-TENNESSEE

In re:
Complaint of Judicial Misconduct

*
*
*No. 06-13-90103
*
*
*
*

M E M O R A N D U M

This complaint was filed with the Judicial Council of the Sixth Circuit pursuant to the Judicial Councils Reform and Judicial Conduct and Disability Act of 1980, P.L. 96-458, as amended by the Judicial Improvements Act of 2002, Pub. L. No. 107-203, the Rules for Judicial-Conduct and Judicial-Disability Proceedings, and the Rules Governing Complaints of Judicial Misconduct adopted by the Judicial Council of the Sixth Circuit.

After conducting an initial review, the chief judge may dismiss a complaint as to which he concludes:

- (1) that the claimed conduct, even if the claim is true, is not “conduct prejudicial to the effective and expeditious administration of the business of the courts” and does not indicate a mental or physical disability resulting in inability to discharge the duties of office;
- (2) that the complaint is directly related to the merits of a decision or procedural ruling;
- (3) that the complaint is frivolous, a term that includes making charges that are wholly unsupported.

Rule 4(c), Rules Governing Complaints of Judicial Misconduct or Disability.

This complaint was filed by a pro se plaintiff in a state-court quiet title action that was removed by the defendants to the federal district court against the district judge who presided over the action following the removal. In her complaint of judicial misconduct, complainant objects to a number of rulings made by the named district judge and contends that the judge is either incompetent or was unduly influenced.

This complaint is subject to dismissal primarily as directly related to the merits of the named judge’s rulings in the underlying action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 352(b)(1)(A)(ii) and Rule 11(c)(1)(B) of the Rules for Judicial-Conduct and Judicial-Disability Proceedings. Such decisions are not the proper subject of a complaint of judicial misconduct. See Rule 3(h)(3)(A), Rules for Judicial-Conduct and Judicial-Disability Proceedings. The Judicial

Council is not a court and has no jurisdiction to review any rulings by a judge, or to grant the relief that may be requested in the underlying case. See *In re Complaint of Judicial Misconduct*, 858 F.2d 331 (6th Cir. 1988). Complainant's challenges to the named judge's rulings directly relate to the merits of the named judge's rulings in the underlying proceedings, and the complaint will be dismissed in part pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 352(b)(1)(A)(ii) and Rule 11(c)(1)(B) of the Rules for Judicial-Conduct and Judicial-Disability Proceedings.

Otherwise, viewed in the context of the pertinent court records, complainant's assertions that the named judge is either incompetent or was unduly influenced are devoid of factual support and inherently incredible. "An allegation may be dismissed as 'inherently incredible' even if it is not literally impossible for the allegation to be true. An allegation is inherently incredible if no reasonable person would believe that the allegation, either on its face or in light of other available evidence, could be true." Implementation of the Judicial Conduct and Disability Act of 1980: A Report to the Chief Justice, Judicial Conduct and Disability Act Study Committee, Sept. 2006, p. 148. In fact, review of the available court records confirm that complainant's assertions are devoid of factual support and are inherently incredible. The complaint therefore will be dismissed in remaining part pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 352(b)(1)(A)(iii) and Rule 11(c)(1)(D) of the Rules for Judicial-Conduct and Judicial-Disability Proceedings.

For these reasons, the complaint will be dismissed both as directly related to the merits of the named judge's decisions and as lacking sufficient evidentiary basis pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 352(b)(1)(A)(ii) & (iii) and Rules 3(h)(3)(A) and 11(c)(1)(B) & (D) of the Rules for Judicial-Conduct and Judicial-Disability Proceedings.



Alice M. Batchelder
Chief Judge

Date: 08-01-14